

Case Study of a Secondary Online Program  
in a Large, Diverse Midwestern Public School District

A DISSERTATION  
SUBMITTED TO THE FACULTY OF THE GRADUATE SCHOOL  
OF THE UNIVERSITY OF MINNESOTA  
BY

Carla Dale Cruzan

IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS  
FOR THE DEGREE OF  
DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

Dr. Judith Lambrecht, Advisor

May 2010

UMI Number: 3408384

All rights reserved

INFORMATION TO ALL USERS

The quality of this reproduction is dependent upon the quality of the copy submitted.

In the unlikely event that the author did not send a complete manuscript and there are missing pages, these will be noted. Also, if material had to be removed, a note will indicate the deletion.

UMI<sup>®</sup>

Dissertation Publishing

UMI 3408384

Copyright 2010 by ProQuest LLC.

All rights reserved. This edition of the work is protected against unauthorized copying under Title 17, United States Code.

ProQuest<sup>®</sup>

ProQuest LLC  
789 East Eisenhower Parkway  
P.O. Box 1346  
Ann Arbor, MI 48106-1346

PREVIEW

© Carla D. Cruzan copyright 2010

### **Acknowledgments**

I wish to thank and acknowledge my advisor, Dr. Judith J. Lambrecht, who was always available, and very generous with her time and willingness to provide good advice, guidance, and support; I owe this degree to her kindness, patience, and her perseverance in sticking with me to the end. I also wish to thank the members of my committee for their much appreciated insights and advice: Dr. Ruth G. Thomas, Dr. Charles D. Miller, and Dr. Roger T. Johnson. I wish to thank Dr. Margaret C. for her friendship and for encouraging and guiding me through the doctoral process. I furthermore want to thank the many students, staff and parents of the District, who willingly shared their experiences and understandings of the District's online learning program with me, including R.J. and E.V-B., who helped me obtain District archival data. I wish to additionally thank my family for their patience, understanding, and sacrifices while I worked many long years, hours, and holidays on this doctorate. This thesis is dedicated to you.

## Dedication

To my children: Catherine, Steven, and Brian Cruzan

and

To my brother: Craig Overhouse

PREVIEW

### Abstract

In a time of growth in secondary education online programs, there have been few studies directed at understanding secondary online programs and the students they serve. That is particularly true for large, inner-city public school districts with a diverse student body. This is a mixed methods case study which identified that students' primary motive for taking online courses in school year 2007-2008 was to take courses in order to fulfill graduation requirements and graduate from high school on time. Considering the online course outcomes for 854 unique students, chi-square tests show that four factors were significant predictors of either a pass or fail outcome for a completed online course: (a) course titles, (b) student ethnicity, (c) student home computer and Internet access, and (d) year-in-school. Gender was not found to be a significant factor. Course frequency data were available for 1,995 courses taken by the 854 students, indicating that approximately two-thirds of courses completed were four core health and physical education online courses that students passed 90 percent of the time. The online program was in the forefront of leading the district toward a more standardized curriculum after many years of site-based management in its seven largest high schools. This case study indicated several areas that may prove beneficial if further research were conducted, including: (a) discovering why more young women than young men took online PE courses, and (b) discovering ways in which to identify at-risk online students who could benefit from additional support.

Keywords: secondary online learning, area learning center (ALC), credit recovery, credit make up, at risk, school choice, standardized curriculum, physical education.

## Table of Contents

Acknowledgments.....	i
Dedication.....	ii
Abstract.....	iii
List of Tables.....	xiii
List of Figures.....	xvii
Chapter 1: Case Study Framework.....	1
Overview.....	1
Background Need.....	2
Historically high dropout rates associated with distance education.....	3
Technologies used in mediating communication affect the distance education experience.....	4
Social contexts and communities of practice vary.....	5
Competition among online learning programs increased in more recent years.....	5
Research Problem.....	8
Theoretical Perspective.....	9
Relevance of the Study.....	10
Online learning as a growing, global phenomenon.....	12
Online learning becoming part of the lifelong learning phenomenon.....	13
A need to learn more about the experiences of secondary online learners. .....	15

Acknowledged recognition of high dropout rates.....	15
Questions.....	18
Purpose.....	22
Delimitations.....	22
Technological infrastructure and adequacies left unexamined.....	23
Course design left unexamined.....	23
Only one researcher and interviewer.....	23
Only student data from school year (SY) 2007-2008 was collected.....	24
Assumptions.....	24
Differences exist between adult learners and high-school students that can impact course-completion outcomes.....	25
High-school students' online learning experiences differ from traditional face-to-face classroom learning experiences.....	26
Online course design and technology can impact course success/non-success.....	26
Assumptions exist about students and the social construction of meaning and cognitive activity.....	27
Assumptions accepted about Vygotskian constructivist theory.....	28
The high cost of developing and teaching online courses.....	28
Summary.....	30
Chapter 2: Literature Review.....	33
The History of Distance Education.....	33

Distance education serves democratic values. ....	34
Distance education served needs of the Industrial Revolution. ....	35
Distance education declined during the Great Depression. ....	37
Distance education grew to meet the needs of nations in war time. ....	40
Distance education grew with advancements in new communications technology. ....	41
Distance education grew with advent of the Internet. ....	43
New content areas in online learning. ....	47
New reasons to expand online learning in schools. ....	48
Two Theoretical Perspectives for the Research. ....	50
Social/cognitive theories in education. ....	50
Motivational theory, self-regulation, and self-efficacy. ....	58
Distance Education Studies. ....	61
Indicators of success. ....	61
Supporting online learning students. ....	66
Supporting at-risk students. ....	67
Summary. ....	72
Chapter 3: Methodology. ....	75
Quantitative Methodology. ....	76
District archival data. ....	76
District’s online pre-course survey. ....	77
History of the survey: “Is Online Learning Right for Me?”. ....	78

Technical description of the survey “Is Online Learning Right for Me?”	81
Student sample.....	81
Data sources.....	83
Database.....	85
Factor analysis of pre-course survey.....	89
Qualitative Methodology .....	98
Summary of Methodologies.....	102
Chapter 4: History of the District’s Online Program.....	106
History and Evolution of the District’s Online Program .....	106
Early online hybrid courses.....	107
Summer 2002 pilot for the online program.....	107
The State offered online AP courses in 2002-2003.....	108
District-offered AP-and-hybrid online courses in 2002-2003.....	109
The District became a State-approved Online Learning Provider in 2003. .....	110
The first year of the online learning program in 2003-2004.....	110
Online program missions.....	115
Factors That Introduced Change into the Online Program .....	121
The position of the online program changed within the District.....	121
Online courses and vendors changed over time.....	123
District online courses moved down into the lower grades.....	124
District summer school courses became web based.....	126

The State increased online testing.....	127
Future changes considered for the online program.....	129
The District as an ALC District with ALC and Online Programs Closely Associated.....	131
Course Requirements Needed for High School Graduation in the District.....	133
The Online Program's Support of Online Teachers.....	136
The teacher role in creating online courses.....	136
Choosing which courses would be taught online.....	138
Online program teacher training.....	139
Planned Moodle training for all District teachers.....	141
Difficulties with teacher-created courses.....	141
Teacher burn out.....	145
District efforts to retain health and PE courses.....	147
Legislated Programs, Funding, and State Requirements.....	152
Title I and II, E-Rate, and referendum funding.....	153
State's general education funding.....	154
Different State regulations for ALC and online programs.....	155
Credit by assessment law.....	157
The District's concern for timely graduation rates.....	158
Summary of Historical Findings.....	163
Chapter 5: Findings.....	166

Research Question 1: What are some of the factors motivating secondary students in the District to take an online course?.....	167
District online course frequencies.....	169
Student demographics in the District's seven largest high schools. ....	178
Relationship of students' ethnicity with course selection and outcome.	180
Relationship of students' year in school with course selection and outcome.....	185
Relationship of students' gender with course selection and outcome. ...	189
Relationship of online course title with course outcome.....	194
Student course-format preferences. ....	198
Research Question 2: What attributes and social capital might a secondary student bring with them to meet the challenges of a secondary online course that will make successful online course completion for credit more likely within the District's activity domain?.....	200
Student antecedent characteristics, attributes, and attitudes. ....	201
Student online course expectations of difficulty.....	201
Students' computer skills and knowledge.....	202
Student access to technology as part of a community of practice. ....	204
Students' social supports for taking an online course.....	209
Research Question 3: What are the District and its stakeholders, as a community of practice (COP) and large inner-city school district, currently doing in an attempt to assist its diverse body of secondary students taking online courses? .....	211

Sources recommending online courses to students.....	211
Communication with parents.....	213
Online program moving the District toward a standardized curriculum.	217
District concern for its own viability in an environment of school-choice competition. ....	223
Summary of Findings.....	226
Chapter 6: Summary, Conclusions, and Recommendations.....	231
Background for Study and Rationale.....	231
Summary of Background Literature.....	233
Summary of Methodologies.....	236
Summary of Historical Findings.....	238
Summary of Findings.....	240
Interpretation Using Activity Theory.....	244
Conclusions.....	254
Research question 1. ....	254
Research question 2. ....	257
Research question 3. ....	258
Recommendations.....	262
Recommendations for practice. ....	262
Recommendations for further research.....	266
References.....	270
Appendix A: Definition of Terms.....	297

Successful Course Completion .....	297
Unsuccessful Course Completion .....	297
Online Course (or Instruction) .....	298
Online Learning (or Education) .....	298
Distance Learning (or Education) .....	298
E-Learning .....	300
Virtual Classroom .....	300
Virtual High School (VHS) .....	300
Virtual Tutoring .....	301
Cyberschools .....	301
Hybrid or Blended Courses .....	301
Corporate Universities .....	301
Correspondence Technology .....	302
Appendix B: District's 20 Question Online Survey .....	304
Appendix C: IRB Letters and Consent Forms .....	306
Appendix D: Note for Parents .....	310
Appendix E: Interviewees and One of Their Many Roles in School Year 2007-2008..	313
Appendix F: Stakeholder Questionnaires .....	314
Questionnaire 1: Student Pre-Course/During-Course Questionnaire .....	315
Questionnaire 2: F-2-F Instructor General Questionnaire .....	326
Questionnaire 3: F-2-F Administrator Questionnaire .....	336
Questionnaire 4: F-2-F Online Administrator Questionnaire .....	347

Questionnaire 5: F-2-F Counselor, Social Worker, and School Psychologist

Questionnaire ..... 359

PREVIEW

### List of Tables

Table 1: <i>Frequency of Unique Students Completing Quarter-Length Courses in Database School Year 2007-2008</i> .....	86
Table 2: <i>Frequency of Online Program's Required Pre-Course Surveys Taken by Students Between September 1, 2007 to April 15, 2008</i> .....	87
Table 3: <i>Frequencies by Quarter with Pass/Fail Grades of All Completed Online Courses in School Year 2007-2008</i> .....	88
Table 4: <i>Factor Analysis on Eight Likert Items from the Pre-Course Survey with Total Variance Explained</i> .....	91
Table 5: <i>KMO and Bartlett's Test of Assumptions to Validate Using Factor Analysis for the Pre-Course Survey</i> .....	95
Table 6: <i>Factor Analysis of Pre-Course Survey: Rotated Structure Matrix Supports Two Theorized Concepts</i> .....	96
Table 7: <i>Factor Analysis of Pre-Course Survey: Rotated Pattern Matrix Confirms Eight Likert Variables Are a Good Fit Within the Two Concepts</i> .....	97
Table 8: <i>Interviewees and One of Their Many Roles in School Year 2007-2008</i> .....	101
Table 9: <i>School Year 2003-2004 Online Student Enrollment</i> .....	113
Table 10: <i>Student Enrollment in Online Courses for 2004 Summer School</i> .....	114
Table 11: <i>Course Requirements Needed for High School Graduation in the District in School Year 2007-2008</i> .....	134
Table 12: <i>State's Weighting of Students ADM General Education Funding in School Year 2007-2008</i> .....	155

Table 13: <i>Frequency of Completed Online Courses by Course Title and Pass/Fail in School Year 2007-2008</i> .....	171
Table 14: <i>Frequency of Completed Online Courses and Students Taking Them Based on School Site in School Year 2007-2008</i> .....	173
Table 15: <i>Frequency of Completed Online Courses by Course Title and School Code Number in School Year 2007-2008</i> .....	175
Table 16: <i>Frequency of Completed Online Course Pass/Fail Rates by School Site in School Year 2007-2008</i> .....	178
Table 17: <i>District's Demographics Compared with Seven Large High Schools' Demographics in School Year 2007-2008</i> .....	179
Table 18: <i>Frequency of Completed Online Courses by Course Title and Ethnicity Based on Pass/Fail in School Year 2007-2008</i> .....	182
Table 19: <i>Frequency of Completed Online Courses by Unique Students' Ethnicity and Their Pass/Fail Outcomes in School Year 2007-2008</i> .....	184
Table 20: <i>Chi-Square Analysis including Actual and Expected Frequencies of Completed Online Courses by Unique Students' Ethnicity and Their Pass/Fail Outcomes in School Year 2007-2008</i> .....	185
Table 21: <i>Completed Online Course Pass/Fail Frequencies Based on Year-in-School (YIS) in School Year 2007-2008</i> .....	186
Table 22: <i>Unique Students' Completed Online Course Pass/Fail Frequencies Based on Year-in-School (YIS) in School Year 2007-2008</i> .....	187

Table 23: <i>Chi-Square Analysis including Actual and Expected Frequencies of Unique Students' Completed Online Course Pass/Fail Frequencies Based on Year-in-School (YIS) in School Year 2007-2008</i> .....	188
Table 24: <i>Frequency of Completed Online Courses by Title and by Gender in School Year 2007-2008</i> .....	191
Table 25: <i>Pass-Fail Frequencies of Online Courses Completed Based on Gender in School Year 2007-2008</i> .....	192
Table 26: <i>Frequency of Completed Online Courses Based on the Gender of Unique Students and Their Pass-Fail Frequencies Outcomes in School Year 2007-2008</i> .....	193
Table 27: <i>Chi-Square Analysis including Actual and Expected Frequencies of Completed Online Courses Based on the Gender of Unique Students and Their Pass-Fail Frequencies Outcomes in School Year 2007-2008</i> .....	194
Table 28: <i>Frequency of Online Courses Taken by Unique Students When Smaller Courses Grouped into Departments in School Year 2007-2008</i> .....	195
Table 29: <i>Frequency of Online Courses and Departments Taken by Unique Students Based on Pass/Fail Outcomes in School Year 2007-2008</i> .....	196
Table 30: <i>Chi-Square Analysis including Actual and Expected Frequencies of Online Courses by Unique Students and Departments Based on Pass/Fail Outcomes in School Year 2007-2008</i> .....	197
Table 31: <i>Unique Students With/Without Computer and Internet Access at Home and Online Course Pass/Fail Frequency During School Year 2007-2008</i> .....	205

Table 32: *Chi-Square Analysis including Actual and Expected Frequencies for Unique Students With/Without Computer and Internet Access at Home and Online Course Pass/Fail Frequency During School Year 2007-2008.....206*

Table 33: *Students With/Without Computer and Internet Access at Home and Pass/Fail Frequency Based on Ethnicity During School Year 2007-2008 .....209*

PREVIEW

### List of Figures

Figure 1: <i>An Education Activity Theory Model Based on Yrjö Engeström's Activity Theory Model</i> .....	53
Figure 2: <i>Scree Plot on Eight Likert Items</i> .....	92
Figure 3: <i>The District's Online Program Activity Theory Model Based on Yrjö Engeström's AT Model</i> .....	246

PREVIEW

## Chapter 1: Case Study Framework

This is a mixed-methods case study of a large urban Midwestern public school district's online learning program that describes the program using both quantitative statistics derived from a pre-course online survey and qualitative interview data. Five chapters follow this chapter, including chapters on a background literature search, methodology, history of the District's online program as part of research sub-question three, a chapter on all three of the sub-research questions, and a concluding chapter containing chapter summaries, conclusions, and recommendations.

### Overview

Today's online learning was anteceded by earlier distance education endeavors. Earliest instances of distance education occurred during the Industrial Revolution when correspondence courses were developed to meet the need for new skills and knowledge. Today, more than a billion people in the world have adopted digital technologies (Palfrey & Gasser, 2008). The rapid advances in information technology and the Internet have led to an explosion, internationally, in online distance education, and the trend shows no signs of slowing. In the United States (U.S.) alone, 3.9 million post-secondary students and over one million K-12 students took an online course in 2007 (Allen & Seaman, 2008, November; Picciano & Seaman, 2007). Given the exponential growth in the number of people of all ages taking online courses, there has been a growing need to better understand how U.S. secondary online learners and their inner-city public school districts, as communities of practice, have been experiencing the new phenomenon of online distance education.

## **Background Need**

In 2009, two-thirds of U.S. universities and colleges were offering online courses (Imsande, 2009, October). Four years earlier in 2005, 42 states had K-12 online learning programs (Greenway & Vanourek, 2006) and there were 85 virtual charter schools (Coffey, 2009, August 18; Greenway & Vanourek, 2006).

Whether looking at the long history of distance education or at today's online learning phenomenon, empirical studies have primarily focused on the experience of adult learners (Roblyer & Marshall, 2002-2003; Roblyer, Mills, Marshall, & Davis, 2007, April 11; Sherow & Wedemeyer, 1990). There was a lack of similar studies of secondary online courses. In a recent U.S. Government meta-analysis of literature published on studies of online learning, it was stated that "An unexpected finding was the small number of rigorous published studies...for K-12 students" (U.S. Department of Education, 2009, May, p. ix). This case study attempted to add to the understanding of secondary online learners and to their inner-city online program.

For the purposes of this case study, the Midwestern school district will henceforth be referred to as the District and its Midwestern state as the State.

There are a number of problem areas associated with distance education in general that may be affecting the nature of secondary online education, even as those problems have been shown to affect adult online education. These include:

- Historically high dropout rates associated with distance education courses.
- Technologies used in mediating communication affect the distance education experience.

- Social contexts and communities of practice vary in that some activity domains function more effectively than others.
- Competition among online learning programs increased in more recent years.

**Historically high dropout rates associated with distance education.**

One of the more common criticisms of adult distance education over the years has been that of high learner dropout rates in comparison to traditional classroom courses (Herbert, 2006; Liu, 2007; Noble, 1999, November; Roblyer & Davis, 2008). According to Pape (2004), “online course completion rates of 50 percent are considered acceptable” (Course completion rates, para. 2). This is a primary concern, because the more a secondary student experiences failure when taking courses, the more likely they are to drop out of high school altogether (Roblyer & Marshall, 2002-2003). Therefore, successful completion rates of students in online courses is deemed important to overall school success and improved high-school graduation rates (Roblyer & Marshall, 2002-2003).

Historically, criticism of high dropout rates led to studies that focused on factors associated with successful course completion rates. A number of studies focused on learner characteristics (Coussement, 1995; Hardy & Boss, 1997). However, according to Roblyer and Marshall (2002-2003), until they conducted their own research, there had been no similar studies conducted on the learner characteristics of secondary students. They found that “student interest in taking online courses does not translate consistently to success in such courses” (p. 241). Therefore, it was necessary to look closer at learner characteristics in an attempt to find predictive instruments and models in order to identify

students likely to be at-risk in an online course with the objective of providing the appropriate support and scaffolding rather than recommending they not take an online course (Cummings, 2009; Herbert, 2006; Liu, 2007; Roblyer & Davis, 2008).

Successful secondary online course completion is important to all concerned stakeholders given the large expenditures in terms of both time and money, stakeholders such as public policy makers, school districts, teachers, parents, and students. It is important that as many registered students as possible successfully complete their online courses (Florida Tax Watch, 2007; Liu, 2007; Paulson, 2004, May 4; Roblyer & Marshall, 2002-2003).

**Technologies used in mediating communication affect the distance education experience.**

Mediating communication technologies affect the distance education experience. In earlier decades, when correspondence technology was used, the experience between instructor and learner was very different from that occurring in today's computer-mediated communications environment. Today's online course programs have found that providing learners with a sense of community and social presence helps improve course satisfaction and reduce online course dropout rates (Ludwig-Hardman & Dunlap, 2003, April; Richardson & Swan, 2003; Wang & Newlin, 2002, May). Wang and Newlin (2002, May) define "social presence" as the degree to which "another individual will enter into a meaningful dialogue" (p. 7). Using software such as Skype permits course participants to engage in video conference calls as a planned, synchronous course event. Webinars, a web-based seminar, are used in larger venues. In addition, online learners